



Cochrane
Library

Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews

Zinc for the common cold (Review)

Singh M, Das RR

Singh M, Das RR.

Zinc for the common cold.

Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews 2015, Issue 4. Art. No.: CD001364.

DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD001364.pub5.

www.cochranelibrary.com

Zinc for the common cold (Review)

Copyright © 2016 The Cochrane Collaboration. Published by John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

WILEY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

HEADER	1
REASON FOR WITHDRAWAL	1
WHAT'S NEW	2
HISTORY	2
SOURCES OF SUPPORT	3

[Intervention Review]

Zinc for the common cold

Meenu Singh¹, Rashmi R Das²

¹Department of Pediatrics, Post Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh, India. ²Department of Pediatrics, All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS), Bhubaneswar, India

Contact address: Meenu Singh, Department of Pediatrics, Post Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Sector 12, Chandigarh, 160012, India. meenusingh4@gmail.com.

Editorial group: Cochrane Acute Respiratory Infections Group.

Publication status and date: Withdrawn from publication for reasons stated in the review, published in Issue 9, 2016.

Review content assessed as up-to-date: 18 January 2013.

Citation: Singh M, Das RR. Zinc for the common cold. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2015, Issue 4. Art. No.: CD001364. DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD001364.pub5.

Copyright © 2016 The Cochrane Collaboration. Published by John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

The editorial group responsible for this previously published document have withdrawn it from publication.

REASON FOR WITHDRAWAL

September 2016 updated withdrawal notice

This Cochrane Review was withdrawn in April 2015, and this withdrawal notice was updated in September 2016.

The review was withdrawn as result of comments submitted via the Cochrane Library by Harri Hemilä in February 2015. Hemilä identified multiple errors in this Cochrane Review and made allegations of plagiarism of text and data from a previously published systematic review (Hemilä H. Zinc Lozenges may shorten the duration of colds: a systematic review. *Open Respiratory Medicine Journal* 2011;5:51-58. dx.doi.org/10.2174/1874306401105010051). The comments referred to the version of this review first published in June 2013 (Singh M, Das RR. Zinc for the common cold. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2013;(6):CD001364. <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/14651858.CD001364.pub4/full>).

The Cochrane Acute Respiratory Infections Group, which maintains the review, withdrew the review in April 2015, pending an assessment of the errors reported, and the group referred the allegations of plagiarism to the Editor in Chief. The Editor in Chief notified the authors of the concerns, and followed the Committee for Publication Ethics (COPE) guidelines.

Replication of text was identified in the Cochrane Review. This was limited to copying of short phrases and was acknowledged by the authors. The level of text plagiarism was minor and at a level that would be addressed by a correction. The Editor in Chief carried out further investigation into the alleged plagiarism of data, with the co-operation of the review authors, who provided supplementary information in support of their work. The allegations related to the derivation of means and standard deviations of data from some of the included studies. Although the authors acknowledge and cite the Hemilä 2011 review, the Editor in Chief considered that the authors' explanation regarding some similarities in presented data between the two reviews was not conclusive.

This version of the review will therefore remain withdrawn.

April 2015 withdrawal notice

This review was withdrawn due to concerns raised via the feedback mechanism regarding the calculation and analysis of data in the review in April 2015. Whilst it is not unusual for reviews to be withdrawn, the editorial group took the view that it would be better to take a cautious approach and explore the source and calculation of data used in the analysis in more detail, rather than keep the review on the Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews for the time being.

WHAT'S NEW

Last assessed as up-to-date: 18 January 2013.

Date	Event	Description
17 September 2016	Amended	This Cochrane Review was withdrawn in April 2015, and this withdrawal notice was updated in September 2016. See Published notes .

HISTORY

Protocol first published: Issue 1, 1999

Review first published: Issue 2, 1999

Date	Event	Description
30 April 2015	Amended	This review was withdrawn due to concerns raised via the feedback mechanism regarding the calculation and analysis of data in the review in April 2015. Whilst it is not unusual for reviews to be withdrawn, the editorial group took the view that it would be better to take a cautious approach and explore the source and calculation of data used in the analysis in more detail, rather than keep the review on the Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews for the time being
29 July 2014	Feedback has been incorporated	Feedback comment added to the review (number 7)
11 December 2013	Amended	Authors have readdressed their reply to the Feedback comment (number 6)
18 October 2013	Amended	Changes made in response to comments received from the Cochrane Editorial Unit
18 January 2013	New citation required but conclusions have not changed	Conclusion regarding the recommendation of zinc for the common cold remains unchanged
18 January 2013	New search has been performed	Searches updated. Three new trials were included in this updated review (Turner 2000a; Turner 2000b; Turner 2000c) and two new trials were excluded (Eby 2006; Kartasurya 2012)
23 March 2012	Amended	Typographical errors to feedback comment amended.
9 January 2012	Feedback has been incorporated	Feedback incorporated.

(Continued)

7 September 2011	Amended	Authors' replies to Feedback comments added to review.
8 August 2011	Feedback has been incorporated	Feedback comments added to review.
17 February 2011	Amended	'Summary of findings' table amended.
29 June 2010	New citation required and conclusions have changed	A new team of review authors have updated this previously withdrawn review. In the previous review, the role of zinc for the common cold was inconclusive, as the results could not be pooled due to the paucity of trials measuring clinically relevant outcomes. In this updated review we were able to undertake pooling of results due to the addition of new trials and we found that zinc is beneficial for the common cold
1 June 2010	New search has been performed	Searches conducted. We included eight new trials (Kurugol 2006a;Kurugol 2006b;Kurugol 2007;Macknin 1998;Petrus 1998;Prasad 2000;Prasad 2008;Vakili 2009) and excluded three new trials (McElroy 2003;Turner 2000a;Veverka 2009) in this update
17 June 2008	Amended	Converted to new review format.
4 May 2006	Amended	Review withdrawn.
24 February 1999	New search has been performed	Review first published Issue 2, 1999.

SOURCES OF SUPPORT

Internal sources

- Post Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research (PGIMER), Chandigarh, India.
- All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS), New Delhi, India.

External sources

- No sources of support supplied